

Republika e Kosovës Republika Kosovo-Republic of Kosovo

Qeveria -Vlada-Government

Ministria e Punëve të Brendshme / Ministarstvo Unutrasnjih Poslova / Ministry of Internal Affairs

Anti -Trafficking Campaign in Kosovo 2012

Final Campaign Evaluation Report

Prepared by: Terre des hommes - Delegation in Kosovo leva Kuneviciute, Anti-Trafficking Specialist December 2012



Table of Contents:

Abstract	3
Introduction	4
General overview	4
Situation analysis	4
Aim	5
Methodology	6
Demographics	7
Chapter 1: Main findings of pre-campaign evaluation survey	7
Chapter 2: Anti-Trafficking Public Awareness Campaign in Kosovo 2012	8
General overview	8
Communication of the campaign	g
Chapter 3: Pre-campaign and post-campaign evaluation surveys: comparative analysis	11
Chapter 4: Post-campaign evaluation: other findings	12
Chapter 5: Anti-Trafficking campaign's assessment	13
Conclusions and Recommendations	14
Bibliography	17
Annex 1: Pre-campaign questionnaire (ENG, ALB)	18
Annex 2: Pre-campaign evaluation statistical report	26
Annex 3: Post-campaign questionnaire (ENG, ALB)	88
Annex 4: Post-campaign evaluation statistical report	104

Abstract



This report presents the final results of a pre- and post- National Anti-Trafficking Campaign evaluation surveys, which took place on 3 –10 September and 24 October – 2 November in Prishtina, Prizren, Peja, Gjakova, Gjilan, Ferizaj and Mitrovica, and areas around.

665 interviews were conducted in People were interviewed about their knowledge and behaviour towards child trafficking, especially child street begging, child forced labour and child sexual exploitation. as well as their opinion about National Anti-Trafficking Campaign.

The final report compares the results of pre-campaign and post-

campaign surveys and also provides the assessment of Anti-Trafficking campaign.

It concludes that approximately half of the respondents have an average knowledge about child trafficking. The knowledge slightly increased after the National Anti-Trafficking Campaign, which was perceived very well by the respondents.

Finally, conclusions on the total results and the evaluation of the Campaign are presented as well as recommendations for the next National Anti-Trafficking and Public Awareness Campaign.

Introduction

General overview

Human trafficking, often called modern-day slavery, is a very complex phenomenon. While in some forms (as country of origin, transit or destination) affecting most countries in the world, human beings are usually trafficked from poorer to richer countries, where there is a higher demand for services by trafficked persons.

Persons from post-conflict areas are particularly vulnerable to human trafficking. Absence of rule of law and law enforcement, loose border control as well as poverty, social inequality and discrimination create favourable conditions for human trafficking to prosper.

The first definition of trafficking in human being was laid down in the United Nations (UN) Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime Article 3a. However, new forms of human trafficking continue to evolve over time, therefore, a modern and more flexible definition is needed in order to address this issue adequately.

European Union Directive 2011/36 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims provided a new and more up-to-date definition of trafficking in human beings, which included new forms of trafficking such as forced labour, forced begging or exploitation of criminal activities.²

Situation analysis

After the war in Kosovo human trafficking increased immensely. Nevertheless, in cooperation with international assistance Kosovo government has been working towards the eradication of human trafficking. New laws adopted, enforced border control and services provided to persons, who are victims of trafficking, as well as campaigns raising public awareness helped Kosovo to

1

¹ Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, Adopted and opened for signature, ratification and accession by General Assembly Resolution 55/25 of 15 November 2000, UN Doc A/55/383, article 3(a).

² EU Directive 2011/36, of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA, article 11.

reduce human trafficking. In 2004 Kosovo was upgraded from Tier 3 to Tier 2 in the US State Department Trafficking in Persons (TIP) report.³

Kosovo Government has incorporated many international conventions and other documents that create legal basis towards the development of adequate legislation against human trafficking as well as adopted numerous domestic laws that regulate various aspects of the issue.

According to Article 171 of the Criminal Code of Kosovo, trafficking in persons means "the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by threat or the use of force or other forms of coercion, abduction, fraud, deception, the abuse of power or the abuse of a position of vulnerability or the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation." What is more, exploitation "shall include, but not be limited to, prostitution of others, pornography or other forms of sexual exploitation, begging, forced or compulsory labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs or tissue."

On the other hand, the latest TIP report of June 2012 states that Kosovo does not yet fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of THB.⁵ Even though the legal framework regarding human trafficking is in place, it is challenged by its "ineffective implementation"⁶. Therefore, further efforts need to be made towards raising awareness among the general population, and especially vulnerable groups, as well as persons working for various institutions that deal with different aspects of trafficking.

Aim

This report presents the results of two evaluation surveys that were conducted in order to evaluate society's awareness about child trafficking and measure the impact of the National Anti-Trafficking Campaign 2012 in Kosovo. The annual campaign lasted one month and aimed

3

³ U.S. Department of State, TIP Report, Country Narratives – Serbia and Montenegro, 2004, http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2005/46616.htm [16/11/2012].

⁴ Criminal Code of The Republic of Kosovo, 2011, Code No. 04/L-082, Promulgated with the decision of the Assembly of Republic of Kosovo, No. 04-V-399, dated 22 June 2012, Article 171, paragraphs 6.1, 6.2, http://www.assembly-kosova.org/common/docs/ligjet/Criminal%20Code.pdf [11/01/2013].

⁵ U.S. Department of State, Trafficking in Persons Report, 19 June 2012, Country Narratives Kosovo, available at: http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2012/192367.htm [12/09/2012].

⁶ Republic of Kosovo, Ministry of Internal Affairs, National Strategy and Action Plan against Trafficking in Human Beings, 2011-2014, August 2011, p. 13.

to raise public awareness on human trafficking as well as to mark European Anti-Trafficking Day (October 18).

The first survey aimed at evaluating Kosovo society's awareness and behaviour towards human trafficking, and, especially, child trafficking to serve as a starting point for the National Anti-Trafficking Campaign. Recommendations were made towards the organisation of the campaign activities to the Inter-Ministerial Group on the implementation of the National Strategy and Action Plan to combat Human Trafficking in Kosovo with a special focus on the Office of National Coordinator for Anti-Trafficking. The second part of the evaluation aimed at comparing the public knowledge before and after the campaign, and also to provide a feedback of the campaign itself.

Methodology

This study is divided into two phases: one evaluation survey was conducted at the end of August – beginning of September – before National Anti-Trafficking campaign in order to assess the knowledge, attitudes and behaviour of Kosovo population; the second evaluation survey was held at the end of October – beginning of November after the campaign ended.

Due to limited time frame 280 interviews were conducted for the pre-campaign evaluation study. The number of interviews was increased to 385 in the second evaluation survey in order to achieve more statistically representative results.

The first phase of the study took place on 3 - 10 September and the second one - on 24 October - 2 November. The interviews were held in Prishtina, Prizren, Peja, Gjakova, Gjilan, Ferizaj and Mitrovica as well as areas around (see the map).

The final Anti-Trafficking Campaign report provides the main findings of the pre-campaign survey (Chapter 1); presents the campaign and describes the activities held (Chapter 2); provides a comparative analysis of pre- and post-evaluation surveys (Chapter 3); additional information and assessment of the campaign (Chapter 4); and finally provides conclusions and recommendations for the next National Anti-Trafficking campaign.

Demographics

In the first phase 280 respondents were interviewed (59% men and 41% women). Among them 40% were people of 15-25 years old, followed by 17% of 25-34 years old and 15% of 35-44 years old. Half of the respondents had secondary of high school education. In total, people from 29 places of residence were interviewed.

In the second phase 385 respondents were interviewed (55% men and 45% women). Among them 56% people of 15-25 years old, 19% of 25-34 years old and 8% of 35-44 years old. More than half of the respondents had secondary of high school education. Respondents from 30 different places of residence were interviewed.

Chapter 1: Main findings of pre-campaign evaluation survey

Just below half of the respondents had an average knowledge about child trafficking, however, one third of the respondents had limited or no knowledge, which indicates that awareness raising campaigns are of vital importance in order to combat child trafficking in Kosovo.

The respondents evaluated the problem of child trafficking in Kosovo as relatively high. Most of the respondents considered child street begging and child forced labour as forms of child trafficking, while only half of the respondents considered sexual exploitation as a form of child trafficking. In addition to this, majority of respondents considered that the most common forms of child trafficking in Kosovo are child street begging and child forced labour. Only a quarter of respondents considered child sexual exploitation as a common form of child trafficking in Kosovo. This can be explained, as sexual exploitation is usually associated with adult trafficking rather than child trafficking. Nevertheless, sexual exploitation is less visible in comparison to other forms of child exploitation. Sexual exploitation remains a hidden phenomenon, a taboo in Kosovo society, where victims are usually blamed rather than the offenders.

In general, respondents were aware of the most important cause factors, which are poverty and organised crime. However, lack of awareness/prevention campaigns were suggested as the third most important cause of child trafficking, which proves that anti-trafficking campaigns are important to improve the knowledge of Kosovo population. On the other hand, the respondents

did not give a lot of weight to the lack of effective legislation and criminal measures, as a cause of child trafficking.

Parents or relatives as well as Kosovo police were indicated as the main actors or institutions to deal with the issue of child trafficking, while NGOs and international organisations were not acknowledged as important actors in fight against child trafficking.

One third of respondents had heard of child trafficking cases. What is more, majority of the respondents would report such cases to Kosovo police or other institutions, if they had any suspicions. Half of the respondents pointed out that Kosovo police were the most efficient institution fighting against child trafficking.

Finally, majority of the respondents indicated that awareness raising campaigns, services to child victims of trafficking, legal framework and fight against corruption and organised crime need relatively very high level of further development, with the biggest concern of fight against corruption/organised crime.

Chapter 2: Anti-Trafficking Public Awareness Campaign in Kosovo 2012

General overview

The National Anti-Trafficking Public Awareness Campaign 2012 was organised in line with National Strategy and Action Plan (NSAP) 2011-2014 and involved all the relevant stakeholders working against trafficking in human beings (THB) working together in Inter-Ministerial Working Group.

"Institutions should put even more efforts to stop child trafficking"

The **overall objective** of the campaign was to "reduce the number of cases of [child] exploitation in Kosovo by a provision of clearly understandable information campaign, giving the victims and potential victims of [child] exploitation the information about the resources available".

This year the campaign focused on the following three areas of child trafficking:

Child street begging

- Child forced labour
- Child sexual exploitation

The campaign sought in achieving two main goals:

- Prevention: inform the society of signs and causes of exploitation;
- **Empowerment**: provide vulnerable groups with information about services and organisations in order to help them to break the cycle of exploitation.

The general goal of the campaign is to change people's attitudes, opinions and eventually behaviour towards child trafficking.

Communication of the campaign

The **slogan** or the catchphrase of the campaign was "Open your eyes. Be aware!" with a general warning message for the public. The slogan was followed by a headline "All against child exploitation!".

The adaptations of the slogan in the three languages of the campaign were incorporated in the colourful **logo**, which aimed to attract children's attention. The final versions of the logo and the slogan were chosen in consultation with children, which was suggested by Terre des hommes. A meeting in Prishtina was organised with children to inquire their opinion for the visual materials of the campaign.







30-second **TV spots** that included local celebrity endorsements (judoist Majlinda Kelmendi, singer Hana Cakuli and actor Fatmir Spahiu) were made. They were aired on RTK, the national broadcaster, 15 times per day for one month starting from 1 October. During October the TV spots were broadcasted at least 450 times.

The TV-spots can be found in the following links:

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ilwvTaYIGDM (178 views)

- http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zjgizljTlsk&feature=plcp (355 views)
- http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fAzFop_fP-w (225 views)

Various outreach methods were used, including:

- Television (TV spots, debates in TV programmes)
- Radio
- Newspapers, online media
- Campaign website in three languages (Albanian, Serbian and Roma)
- Leaflets and posters (2200 leaflets and 1300 posters in the three languages)
- Billboards
- Informal discussions, workshops, presentations

Among other means of communications, campaign **websites** in Albanian, Serbian and Roma languages were developed. In the first month, there were more than 1000 unique visits (950 visits to Albanian version, 50 to the Serbian and 20 to the Roma version).

Albanian version: <u>www.hapisyte.org</u>

• Serbian version : www.otvorioci.org

Roma version: www.putartereyakha.org

Representatives of relevant organisations participated in debates in five **TV shows** targeting different audiences (from lifestyle to children shows).

The total budget of the National Anti-Trafficking Campaign was 13 374.24 Euros.

Organisation	Budget
EU OFFICE/EU PROJECT:	€ 6,509.24
TERRE DES HOMMES:	€3,810.00
UNDP:	€3,430.00
TOTAL (core campaign costs)	€13,374.24

Chapter 3: Pre-campaign and post-campaign evaluation surveys: comparative analysis

This chapter provides a comparative analysis of the results of pre-campaign and post-campaign survey in order to evaluate the possible impact of the campaign to the Kosovo society's knowledge about the issue of child trafficking.

The number of respondents with very good or good knowledge about child trafficking increased by approximately 11 per cent (in the second evaluation survey – 28 per cent), while those with limited or no knowledge about child trafficking declined by approximately 7 percent. The number of respondents with average knowledge also slightly decreased. These statistics prove that the National Anti-Trafficking Campaign has had a positive effect towards improving the knowledge of Kosovo population about child trafficking, which was one of the main goals of the Campaign.

There have not been significant changes concerning forms of child trafficking: the number respondents claiming that child street begging is a form of child trafficking slightly decreased, while the number of those, who answered that child forced labour and child sexual exploitation are forms of child trafficking, increased a little.

The main causes of child trafficking remained the same – poverty (64%) and organized crime (17%).

The **number of respondents** who thought that **child sexual exploitation** is the most important form of child trafficking **in the context of Kosovo doubled** – from 18 percent to 37 per cent, while child street begging declined from 47 per cent to 35 per cent.

While the main actors responsible to deal with child trafficking remained parents or relatives (71%), the police (51%) and governmental institutions (44%), it is interesting to note that after the Anti-Trafficking Campaign the number of respondents choosing the option "Parents or relatives" as the actor responsible to deal with child trafficking dropped from 80 per cent to 65. The **importance** acknowledged by the respondents slightly **increased for International organizations, NGOs, schools and society.**

Although the number of respondents who already have reported a suspicious case of child trafficking, and the ones, who would report have not changed significantly (around 88 per cent),

the respondents who would not know, where to report, or the ones who would not care slightly decreased (~2-3 per cent).

The Police remained the **main institution to report** the suspicions of human trafficking (with 86 per cent of respondents). Among the other institutions to report, family, local authorities, National Helpline and KFOR were mentioned.

Kosovo police is still considered to be the most efficient institution to fight against child trafficking (around half of the respondents in both phases), while social services continue to be considered as an efficient institution to fight against child trafficking only by 17 per cent of the respondents. Trust for local NGOs as an actor to fight child trafficking slightly decreased.

The answers to last four questions, where respondents were asked to evaluate certain areas on their need for further development remained very similar to the first phase of evaluation. All four activities – awareness raising/prevention campaigns, services provided to child victims of trafficking, legal framework/criminal measures, fight against corruption and organised crime need relatively high further development.

Chapter 4: Post-campaign evaluation: other findings

In comparison to the knowledge about child trafficking, in the second phase of evaluation respondents were asked about their knowledge about human trafficking in general. 32 per cent of the respondents answered that their knowledge is very good or good, 38 per cent – average and one third – limited or none. The figures are similar to the answers for the knowledge about child trafficking; however, slightly more respondents claimed to have a very good or good knowledge about human trafficking in general than about child trafficking. Respondents from Prizren and Mitrovica claimed to have a better knowledge than respondents from other cities.

63 per cent of the respondents answered that according to their opinion, there is difference a between child exploitation by parents and by traffickers, which shows that there is perception in the society, that exploitation by family members is associated with poverty, rather than criminal activity, which exploitation by traffickers is considered to be.

63 per cent of the respondents thought that children are trafficked both – inside and outside Kosovo, while one fifth answered that children are trafficked internally only.

More than one third of respondents claimed that they had heard of non-Kosovo citizens trafficked or exploited in Kosovo.

The most popular mean to learn about human trafficking is TV (75 per cent), followed by traditional (print) media (25 per cent) and school or university (24 per cent). Among other means, radio and social media were mentioned.

Slightly more than half of the respondents claimed that the legal sanction for human trafficking in Kosovo is capital punishment (the capital punishment was abolished in 2002). It was followed by 38 per cent thinking that is imprisonment for more than five years.

Chapter 5: Anti-Trafficking campaign's assessment

The respondents were asked where they had heard about human trafficking from (if so) in the last four weeks (during the National Anti-Trafficking Campaign). 58 per cent responded that it was TV, 10 per cent – traditional (print) media, around 7 per cent – through other people. 26 per cent had not heard about human trafficking in the last four weeks.

More than one third of respondents heard about National Anti-Trafficking Campaign. The following statistics are based on these 129 respondents that had heard about the Campaign.

"The Campaign should be organized not only in Prishtina, but also in other cities" More than half of respondents from Prishtina had heard about the Campaign, followed by 44 per cent from Mitrovica and 35 per cent from Ferizaj.

Majority of the respondents claimed that the Campaign was excellent or very good. **TV** was the most popular form of the Campaign, which was followed by billboards (27 per cent), articles in the media (13 per cent), poster and leaflets

(12 and 10 per cent respectively). Billboards were the most visible in Prizren, Gjakova, Mitrovica and Ferizaj. Posters had not been in seen in Ferizaj and Gjakova at all, while one fifth of respondents in Peja and Prishtina had come across them. One third of the respondents in Peja had come across the leaflets of the Campaign, however, there was no one in Ferizaj, Gjakova, Gjilan or Prizren. Only 2 per cent of respondents heard about or attended community events,

lectures and workshops. Only the respondents from Ferizaj and Prishtina had heard about these events. The campaign websites in three languages were not very popular either: Less than 15 per cent of respondents visited the website of the Campaign.

Almost half of the respondents heard about Anti-Trafficking helpline, which was promoted during the Campaign. What is more, 18 calls were received during one month of the campaign, while, in comparison, in the first year of operations (October 2011 – September 2012) only 100 calls received were received in total.

Finally, the majority of the respondents learnt at least a little from the Anti-Trafficking Campaign. More than half of the respondents thought that the organisation of the Campaign was very well. In particular, respondents from Gjakova, Mitrovica and Prizren.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The two evaluation surveys revealed the current situation of the knowledge about human trafficking, and child trafficking in particular, in Kosovo. The pre-campaign evaluation survey served as an entry point for the situation analysis and the assessment of the Campaign. It revealed that the majority of the respondents claimed to have an average knowledge about child trafficking, which slightly improved after the National Anti-Trafficking Campaign. The respondents were aware of different forms of child exploitation, however, the knowledge varied in different areas. During both of the evaluation surveys respondents were aware of the most

important cause factors, which are poverty, organised crime.

"Children are very important and we should continue to work in order to protect them and continue with such campaigns"

The Kosovo police was acknowledged as one of the most effective actors to fight against child trafficking. After the Campaign more trust was shown for International organizations, NGOs, schools and society for their capability to fight against child

trafficking. On the other hand, the acknowledgement for social services as efficient actor to fight against child trafficking remains low, which proves that child trafficking is perceived only from the criminal perspective.

Furthermore, the majority of the respondents claimed that they would report suspicions about child trafficking to the police as well as other institutions or family.

The second evaluation survey revealed more information about the society's knowledge about child trafficking: more than half of the respondents claimed that there is a difference between child exploitation by parents and traffickers (which shows that exploitation by family members is usually associated with poverty rather than criminal activity) as well as that children are trafficking not only within Kosovo but also outside.

It is interesting to note that while capital punishment was abolished in 2002, more than half of the respondents thought that this is the sentence for human trafficking.

TV is the most powerful mean to learn about human trafficking as well as TV spots and other appearances on TV shows regarding trafficking were very efficient. Billboards were also very visible. However, the distribution of leaflets and posters was not so successful: none of the respondents came across leaflets in Ferizaj, Gjakova, Gjilan or Prizren.

While the benefits of social media and social networks was also mention, these means were not used for the Campaign. The promotion of the Campaign websites was also not sufficient enough: less than 15 per cent of respondents visited them.

On the contrary, half of the respondents were aware of National Anti-Trafficking Helpline, and during the Campaign, there was an increased number of calls.

Finally, the National Anti-Trafficking Awareness Campaign was positively evaluated by the respondents: in the sense of its organisation and the educative content.

Therefore, it is recommended:

- To start the preparation for the next year Campaign earlier, therefore a clear communication strategy, action plan and budget can be prepared and tasks divided among stakeholders. The system of monitoring of the Campaign should be organised in advance.
- Better communication and coordination among stakeholders participating in the Campaign.

- As the knowledge about human trafficking remains average, more information should be provided to the local population with a special focus to the groups and communities affected in a clear and simple manner.
- The campaign should include more activities in various cities in Kosovo What is more, long-term campaign, conducted in several months throughout the year, should be considered.
- As the results suggests, some activities (e.g. community events or workshops) or forms (e.g. distribution of leaflets and posters) of the campaign were absent (or not communicated enough) in certain areas. Local NGOs and school or university students should be more engaged in the process as well as better communication of the activities. More group discussions with various age groups should be organised.
- The use of social media/social networks: It is an easy and cheap way to get engaged with the public, share information and have a two-way communication. What is more, this way would lead to more visits of campaign website and better distribution of the message of the Campaign, especially among younger audience.
- As TV was the most influential mean of the Campaign, better coordination of the TV spots is essential. What is more, the Campaign should use the possibilities to advertise for free as the Campaign is dedicated for the public benefit.
- More attention should paid to the National Anti-Trafficking and Domestic Violence
 Helpline: the issues between mobile operators should be resolved as well as people,
 who work in the Helpline, should be trained to be able to provided assistance to the
 clients.
- Finally, as only three organisations contributed to the Campaign financially, it is vital that proper financial support should be provided by the State structures.

Bibliography

- Criminal Code of The Republic of Kosovo, 2011, Code No. 04/L-082, Promulgated with the decision of the Assembly of Republic of Kosovo, No. 04-V-399, dated 22 June 2012, Article 171, paragraphs 6.1, 6.2, http://www.assembly-kosova.org/common/docs/ligjet/Criminal%20Code.pdf [11/01/2013].
- 2. EU Directive 2011/36, of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA, article 11.
- 3. Republic of Kosovo, Ministry of Internal Affairs, National Strategy and Action Plan against Trafficking in Human Beings, 2011-2014, August 2011, p. 13.
- 4. Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, Adopted and opened for signature, ratification and accession by General Assembly Resolution 55/25 of 15 November 2000, UN Doc A/55/383, article 3(a).
- 5. U.S. Department of State, TIP Report, Country Narratives Serbia and Montenegro, 2004, http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2005/46616.htm [16/11/2012].
- 6. U.S. Department of State, Trafficking in Persons Report, 19 June 2012, Country Narratives Kosovo, available at: http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2012/192367.htm [12/09/2012].